

Articles by Kamien, McKee, and Temperley

Q1) Read pp. 311-320 (plus Ex. 3b & 4). Kamien's "conflicting melody/accompaniment metrical patterns" tend to occur in a certain kind of situation. What is that situation?

Kamien defines a "conflicting metrical pattern" as one in which a hypermetrical group in one layer is followed by a conflicting hypermetrical group in another layer or instrument (311). In a sense, Kamien is describing a large-scale displacement dissonance if we were to describe this situation using Krebs's terminology. As with other types of metrical dissonance, the conflicting metrical patterns between accompaniment and melody often occur in transitional or bridge sections within a musical work as the composer moves from one thematic area to another. Moreover, the hypermetric group of the accompaniment typically begins first, succeeded by the melody's hypermetric group (313). Usually, a single bar of the hypermeter separates this hypermeter in the melody from that of the accompaniment, thereby creating a conflict in the alternation of strong and weak hypermetric beats between the two parts as well.

Q2) Read pp. 1-9. What is meant by the notation [1234], [2341], [3412], [4123]? Do you think some of these four patterns are more common or normative than others? Does McKee think so? Do you think other theorists we have studied would think so?

McKee's bracket notation ([1234] etc.) refers to the bar in which the melody enters with regard to the hypermeter, i.e. what McKee calls the *melodic rhythm* (2). The term *melodic rhythm* is McKee's homage to Rothstein's concept of *phrase rhythm*. I am not sure why such an unwieldy bracket notation was necessary for McKee to adopt (except that it visually represents the rotation of the bars), since a simpler label such as H1, H2, etc. would seem to have been sufficient. The situation described by the notation [1234], where the melody begins on the strongest beat of the hypermeter, is probably the most common of these four patterns. Ironically, in Figure 1 McKee calls all four of these patterns "extended anacrusis," yet the most common of these patterns ([1234]) is not an extended anacrusis at all. I imagine that the second most common of McKee's patterns would be the [4123] arrangement, in which the melody enters on a bar prior to the hypermetrical downbeat. McKee confirms that both of the normative patterns I mention are common in Mozart's minuets (5-6). Further evidence for the normative status of [1234] is provided by L&J's MPR9, since in this case, the metrical structure and grouping structure are "in-phase." The [2341] extended anacrusis was also discussed in Kamien's article, where the melody often enters displaced one bar later than the accompaniment.

Q3) Read pp. 125-139. While end-accented phrases are (according to Temperley) definitely less common than beginning-accented phrases, there is one situation in which they seem to be normative. What is that situation, and why do end-accented phrases commonly occur there?

According to Temperley, end-accented phrases, although sometimes (rarely) occurring within first and second themes, are quite common among closing themes. In his category of closing themes, Temperley broadens the definition somewhat to include closing themes found in sections of pieces other than just those pieces in sonata form (as in his Chopin example). Temperley cites two possible reasons for the common appearance of end-accented phrases in closing themes. Firstly, the closing theme typically begins on (in the case of elision) or immediately after a strong tonic cadence on the downbeat of a measure and a hypermeasure. Thus, for the sake of parallelism, the succeeding phrases often begin immediately after a strong cadence. Secondly, Temperley posits that the change from beginning-accented phrases to end-

accented phrases in the closing theme may also act as a musical clue to the listener that a large formal section of the work is about to come to a close, the end-accented phrases therefore serving a structural function. Temperley does not attempt to elevate one view of the reasoning behind end-accented phrases over another.

WORKS CITED

- Kamien Roger. 1993. "Conflicting Metrical Patterns in Accompaniment and Melody in Works by Beethoven and Mozart: A Preliminary Study." *Journal of Music Theory* 37/2, 311-348.
- McKee, Eric. 2004. "Extended Anacruses in Mozart's Instrumental Music." *Theory and Practice* 29, 1-37.
- Temperley, David. 2003. "End Accented-Phrases: An Analytical Exploration." *Journal of Music Theory* 47/1, 125-54.